Open Records Process: Effective Strategies for Community Organizers to Boost Immigration Advocacy

January 29, 2020

Presenters
• Christy Williams, CLINIC
• Lena Graber, Immigrant Legal Resource Center
• Ian Head, Center for Constitutional Rights
• Claudia Valenzuela, American Immigration Council
• Raul Pinto, North Carolina Justice Center

Workshop Goals
• Knowledge of the Open Records Process and how to request public records
• Why you and why now?
• Strategies to use open records requests and documents to advance advocacy priorities
• Case studies
• Resource guide
Why Now?
• Federal immigration agenda has taken hold at state and local levels. For example,
  – 287(g) program expansion
  – Anti-Sanctuary Policies
  – E-Verify mandates
• State and local resources are being diverted towards advancing federal priorities
  – Without gov’t transparency
  – To the detriment of your community needs

Why You?
• Last line of defense to protect your neighbors and community resources
  – Reverse anti-immigrant policies and infrastructure
  – Ensure gov’t accountability
• Shape the future of your locality through policies that:
  – Prioritize public safety
  – Ensure equal access to opportunities for all
  – Promote immigrant integration

Methelus v. School Board of Collier County, Florida
• In 2013, nearly 200 immigrant students and English language learners who were 16 years or older were denied admission to Collier County Public Schools.
• Through the open records process, the SPLC obtained the School Board’s enrollment policy.
• **Policy:** Lowered the max. age a student could enroll in high school, if officials thought the student would not graduate within two years.
Methelus v. School Board of Collier County, Florida Cont’d.

- Under the policy, students were placed in adult learning programs.
- SPLC sued the school board for denying equal access to educational opportunities for immigrant youth and won!
- The School Board allowed those who were denied enrollment to appeal the decision.

Lena Graber
Senior Staff Attorney, Immigrant Legal Resource Center

Preparing for a PRA*
Request

*Also called: “Public Records Act” “Open Records Act” “Sunshine Law” “Public Information Act” etc.
Outline

- Four Steps for Planning a Records Request
- Comparing PRA v FOIA
- What partners might be helpful in obtaining or publicizing my results?
- Planning for surprises
- How will I use my results?

4 Step Framework for Planning a Records Request

1. What information do I want?
2. What kinds of documents and records would have that information?
3. What agency or agencies hold the relevant documents?
4. What is the best way to get those records?

1. What Information Do I Want?

For example:
- Handling of immigrant children in school placement
- Involvement of the county sheriff’s department in detaining immigrants
- Access to local medical services for individuals with limited English proficiency
- Treatment of immigrant children in the juvenile court system
- Number of immigrants arrested by local police
- Backstory on how state legislators launched an anti-immigrant law
2. What kinds of documents should I look for?

It can help to identify the types of records or documents you think will have the information you seek, whether or not you specify them in the request. Common examples might be:

- **Financial records** – budgets, expenditures, audits
- **Internal policies and protocols** – guidance or internal policies from different bodies or agencies
- **Data collected** – aggregate information about the work of a public entity
- **Contracts or Agreements** – many kinds of contracts can show different relationships
- **Meeting notes or agendas** – beyond PRA laws, local ordinances may require transparency about meetings involving elected officials

3. What agency holds these records?

Different agencies keep different records. You must ask the right agency for the records you seek, or else you may get no results.

- Local vs statewide information
- Information about the activities of elected officials
- Bureaucratic records resulting from administration of local functions

Of course, you can file requests with multiple agencies.

**Example**

Sasha is part of a coalition working to fight mass incarceration. To develop its advocacy strategy, the group is trying to determine what contracts the local jail may have with the federal government, including ICE.

Sasha drafts a detailed request about communications and contracts with the federal government related to detaining people at the jail. When it comes to addressing the letter, Sasha realizes that he had been operating under the assumption that the request would go to the police department. But in fact, some online research and discussion with others in the coalition shows Sasha that the main jail is run by the county sheriff, and that there is a second detention facility managed by the county executive. Furthermore, the police department has a large hold room which the coalition believes may also be used by ICE.

Sasha revises the draft into three requests: one to the sheriff’s department, one to the office of the county executive, and one to the police department.
4. What is the best way to get these records?

Before you file a PRA request, consider other ways of getting the information you want:

- Google / other research
- Call the agency and ask for the document or records
- Ask a local elected official to get the document or information for you
- Work with a journalist who is investigating the issue
- File a federal FOIA request

Example

Olga has heard that her county sheriff may have joined the 287(g) program and she is concerned.

Before filing a PRA request to the Sheriff’s Department for any 287(g) contracts, Olga does some online research and finds ICE’s webpage that lists existing 287(g) agreements: www.ice.gov/287g. The page shows that her county does in fact have a 287(g) agreement, and a link to a signed copy of it is included.

Olga wants to know what led to this agreement, but cannot find any news articles or other information. She contacts her county commissioner, but learns that he was also unaware of the 287(g) program until her inquiry. Olga asks the commissioner to dig into the matter under his authority on the county council.

Comparing PRA and FOIA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PRA Request</th>
<th>FOIA Request</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Only certain local or state functions will have immigration-related documents</td>
<td>Immigration records are mostly federal – visas, status, immigration history, enforcement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local or state agencies may not have immigration or citizenship status information</td>
<td>Can take a very long time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Usually much faster and easier than federal FOIA</td>
<td>More likely to require litigation to get a response – especially from ICE, CBP, or State Dept.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benefit of local access and relationships</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Potential Partners

- Allied organizations — partnering with other organizations may strengthen your request or increase the likelihood of a timely response
- Legal support — you do not need to be a lawyer to file these requests or to appeal them, but it can help to line up legal support in advance just in case
- Media — you may especially want to work with media once you have the records, but publicizing the filing of your request can be an important advocacy strategy

Planning for Surprises

- Information you don't expect
- Delays
- Incomplete response
- Agency doesn't understand your request
- No one has been tracking the information you want
- Unusual formats of records — e.g. audio recordings
- ICE fighting the release of records — 8 USC 236.6

How will I use the results?

- Advocacy
- Improvement of services
- Litigation
- Research and analysis
- Education
Overview of the Open Records Process

How does one request public records

A “public record” can be all sorts of different things:

• Emails
• Memos
• Letters
• Video or audio recordings
• Spreadsheets and databases
• Contracts

Be creative in what you ask for!

Every state’s open records law has different procedures for making a public records request, which might have different names, like “PRA” or “FOIL” or “ORR” – but the process will generally be similar. At the end of this section I will list some resources for finding your state’s law.
How does one request public records

• A request for public records is basically a letter asking a state agency to send you documents that you believe it may have in its possession.
• You can request records from almost any state agency. For example, you could ask for records from the Chicago Police Department, or the Orange County School Board in California.
• There may be a few places you cannot request information from however.

Key things to include in your request

A brief description of what types of records you’re looking for. For example: “Any communications, such as emails and/or letters, between the Denver Police Department and ICE or DHS regarding the department’s new detainer policy.”

If there are recent news articles or events that can show an agency should have the records you’re after, you can include links and references. For example: “See the article Police Department Issues New Detainer Policy in the Denver Post, January 1, 2020, where Chief Joe Smith is quoted discussing the new detainer policy.”

Key things to include in your request

✓ Ask for a “fee waiver” – this means asking not to pay for the documents you receive, or pay a discounted rate. In your ask, you can include a brief description of who you or your organization are, to help show that you intend to use the records you receive for the public interest.
✓ It can be helpful to reiterate the date by which an agency must respond under your state’s open records law, and also ask for the agency to provide reasons if they decide to deny your request.
✓ Include your contact information for the agency to write back with any questions and to send any records to.
Timeline

1. Send your request in a way that you have proof it was received by the agency – like Fed Ex, and/or asking for email acknowledgement.
2. Each state will have its own timeline for how soon an agency, by law, must respond. It is important to look this up before sending your request. It could be one week, or one month.
3. Keep a log of all interactions you have with each agency! It will be very useful later on if your request is denied, especially if you decide to go to court.

Timeline

1. When the agency responds, it should tell you whether it is “denying” or “granting” your request. Sometimes they will grant parts of your request and deny other parts.
2. If they grant your request, often they will give you an estimate of when you will receive records. If they are charging fees for making copies and processing of documents, they may first send you an invoice before producing the documents to you.
3. If they deny your request, don’t give up! You can appeal any denial of your request.

Denials and Appeals

• If your request is denied, most state open records laws require that an agency must provide a reason(s) for doing so.
• Often, the open records law in your state will have a list of reasons that a state can deny or “exempt” information you requested. This could be for reasons such as "law enforcement investigation" or "deliberative process." It is good to review these exemptions beforehand if you are able.
• Different states will have different processes and timelines for how to appeal the denial of a request.
Denials and Appeals

There are generally a few ways you can appeal a denial.

1. You can argue that the reasons (or lack of reasons) an agency gave in their denial are not part of the “exemptions” listed in your state’s law that allow an agency to deny or redact information.
2. You can argue that the agency’s reasoning for denying the records is incorrect, and provide evidence showing why you think so.
3. You can argue that the agency did not search for records in the correct office or place or person(s).

What’s next?

• There will be a timeframe set by your state’s open records law in which the agency that hears open records appeals will respond to your appeal.
• If your appeal is denied, you can then choose to file a lawsuit to try and obtain records.
• You can also do public and media advocacy to add pressure.
• You can also try and negotiate with an agency.

Where to find info about your state’s open records’ laws and procedures

• National Freedom of Information Coalition - https://www.nfoic.org/organizations/state-foi-resources
• Google! It is always good to do a few searches to make sure the local law hasn’t changed, find other resources or just to get the correct address or email to send your request to.
CLAUDIA VALENZUELA
FOIA ATTORNEY, AMERICAN IMMIGRATION COUNCIL

RECEIVING THE RECORDS

TRACKING RECORDS
• Create a good organizing system for requesting and receiving records:
  ▪ Electronic folders, clearly labelled (e.g.)
  ▪ Keep a final copy your request - mark it clearly
  ▪ If you file request by email or electronically: save confirmation that agency received request
  ▪ If by certified mail, scan a copy of receipt but keep original in paper file as well
  ▪ Save any correspondence by the agency
  ▪ If you receive documents in separate productions, track the date received and save productions in individuals files (Excel)
TRACKING RECORDS

- Be sure to review agency correspondence closely. This will inform you of important matters, such as
  - Whether the agency will invoke an extension of the deadline to reply to your request
  - Whether the agency will grant or deny your fee waiver
  - Whether the agency requests that you narrow your request
  - Whether the agency is closing your request
  - Appeal timelines

REVIEWING RECORDS

- Review records as soon as possible after you receive them
- If you have filed your open records request with partners, i.e. “co-requesters,” it’s a good idea that any partnership agreement includes clarity on who is responsible for reviewing documents and timelines for review
  - Consider uploading documents to a shared access platform, such as GoogleDocs or DocuCloud. These platforms can also help showcase documents. But - safeguard confidentiality concerns.
- Be careful with data!

MISSING RECORDS OR REDACTIONS?

- Review records closely
- Are any records missing?
  - Are there other records or information publicly available that suggest records that you did not receive exist?
    - News articles referencing a governmental agreement, *e.g.* HamedAleaziz, “The Trump Administration is Scrambling to Make its ‘Safe Third Country’ Asylum Deal with Guatemala a Reality, Memo Shows,” BUZZFEED NEWS (July 30, 2019)
- Are records redacted?
DEALING WITH MISSING RECORDS/REDACTIONS

• State open records or “FOIA” officers can be helpful in dealing with requests for records, including missing records (or a lack of response by the state agency)
• Consider working with these officers to facilitate a records request
• Be mindful of final responses and appeal deadlines however!
• Ultimately, only recourse maybe be filing a lawsuit in state court (particularly when it comes to law enforcement-related records or redactions)

GOING TO COURT

• Important to have request timeline clear and well-documented (i.e. when it was filed, deadlines, your efforts, any responses by the agency)
• Ensure you have exhausted all requirements under state law (including appeals when required)
• State court procedures vary: consider partnering with a pro bono attorney
• Litigation can be prolonged

SHARING INFORMATION

• When partnering with others on an open records request, consider creating a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) that includes (among other terms):
  ▪ Goal of the request for information
  ▪ All partner roles and responsibilities
  ▪ How and when to share documents beyond partnership (e.g. lawyers working on a lawsuit; the media)
  ▪ Potential vision/plan for sharing the documents publicly (e.g. posting documents on a website or other public forum; media, written publication)
EXECUTING THE PLAN

- Media? (press release, press call, reporter coverage)
- Posting documents publicly?
- Assist litigation efforts?
  - https://www.nationalimmigrationproject.org/PDFs/practitio
  - ners/our_lit/foia_dhs_return/2014_411en_morawetz-declar.pdf
- Report or publication?
  - https://immigrantjustice.org/sites/default/files/content-
type/research-item/documents/2017-
  - 07/NIJC-2017-transparency-humanRights%20Project-
  - cc%20August%20202015%20Report%20FINAL3.pdf
- Advocacy campaign...

RAUL PINTO
Senior Staff Attorney
North Carolina Justice Center

NC CASE STUDY:
Police checkpoint target minority neighborhoods

- Identifying problem: Checkpoint in immigrant communities
- Identifying possible solution:
  - Litigation?
  - Community advocacy?
  - Media exposure?
- Defining the scope of the information needed
  - Prior to sending request
  - While request is pending
- Getting and working with the information
NC CASE STUDY -

In Winston-Salem, we:
1. Reports – checkpoints outside mobile home parks.
2. Goal: Ameliorate the condition by applying community pressure; litigate if necessary.
3. Worked with police’s attorney on response.
4. Presented the information to public.

NC CASE STUDY: Obstacles we hit

- Efficiency
- Costs
- Patience required: Custodian of public records...shall, as promptly as possible, furnish copies. N.C.G.S. § 132-6.
- “I ain’t got ‘em.”

NC CASE STUDY: Accomplishments
Resource: Open Records Guide for Immigration Advocates

www.cliniclegal.org/resources/state-and-local

Questions

Catholic Legal Immigration Network, Inc.

National Office
8757 Georgia Avenue, Suite 850
Silver Spring, MD 20910
Main Phone: (301) 565-4800
Main Fax: (301) 565-4824
cliniclegal.org
fb.com/cliniclegal